

Contents

Introduction ... page 3

Key findings ... page 4

The rationale behind the Wasteful Expenditure Monitor ... page 4

Annexure 1: New items of Wasteful Expenditure ... page 6

Annexure 2: Wasteful Expenditure as of April 2010 ... page 11

One year and R1.5 billion wasted: How the ANC is spending public funds

One year has passed since the Democratic Alliance (DA) first set up the Wasteful Expenditure monitor in July 2009, to track fruitless and wasteful spending by ANC-run government departments and public entities. The DA has been fully supportive of Finance Minister Pravin Gordhan's efforts to curb this self-indulgent spending by his ANC colleagues so that state funds can be directed to what matters: providing services to ordinary South Africans.

Unfortunately, Minister Gordhan's call back in 2009 seems to have been ignored, as illustrated by the increasingly lavish spending by ANC ministers and officials on luxury cars, prolonged stays in five-star hotels, tickets to major sporting events and

self-congratulatory advertising. All of this is money that could have been spent more wisely on such essential services as healthcare, education and housing.

On the other hand, in the Western Cape, where the DA governs, we have slashed the amounts previously spent by the ANC administration on luxury cars, parties and unnecessary advertising so that these funds can be better directed towards providing services to people. Over the next three years, the Medium Term Expenditure Framework for the province has identified R 2.1 billion in efficiency savings across all departments.

Introduction

The primary purpose of this report is provide a comprehensive account of instances of wasteful and fruitless spending by members of the ANC elite in government over the past 12 months.

Since it was first set up in July 2009, the DA's Wasteful Expenditure Monitor has tracked **R1.447 billion** in wasted public funds. This represents an approximately **R500 million** increase since the last Wasteful Expenditure Monitor report was released in April this year.

The attached annexure to the report is divided into six sections, each providing a quantifiable index of a particular aspect of wasteful expenditure.

Of particular concern to the DA is the fact that every single one of the Wasteful Expenditure Monitor indices we have been tracking has shown a marked increase since the last report was released in April 2010.

Details of these increases are provided below:

Wasteful Marketing, e-Marketing and Self-Congratulatory Advertising

Previous total: R16.5-million
New total: R 19.4 million

Hotelgate: Unnecessary Property Rentals, Hotel Stays and Property Renovations

Previous total: R 4.5 million
New total: R 241 million

Cargate: wasteful expenditure on luxury vehicles for politicians

Previous Total: 47.4 million
New total: R 65.8 million

Partygate: Wasteful expenditure on Parties, Conferences and Other Events

Previous total: R 203 million
New total: R 209 million

Other items of wasteful expenditure

Previous total: R 732.9 million
New total: R 776 million

We have also had to add a sixth index to the Wasteful Expenditure Monitor - 'Ticketgate' - tracking the explosion of public spending by government state departments and entities on tickets to sporting and entertainment events. Details of this additional index are included in the report that follows.

Key findings

The key findings of the Wasteful Expenditure Monitor report thus far are as follows:

- In less than a year, the ANC administration has wasted approximately **R1.5 billion** on unnecessary items such as new luxury cars, hotel accommodation and entertainment.
- If these funds had been spent wisely, they could have provided over **1.1 million people affected by HIV/ AIDS** with the care they need to stay healthy (it costs approximately R 1300 per year to provide care to an HIV affected person in the public sector – this does not include ARV treatment).
- R 1.5 billion could have provided **bursaries for 50 000 students** to pay for the first year of tuition in a B.Com programme at a top South African university.
- R 1.5bn could also have been used to provide electricity connections to over **185 000 low-cost houses** across the country (it costs approximately R 7500 to connect a house to the national grid).
- The national department with the highest wasteful expenditure bill was the Department of Public Works which spent approximately **R 99 million** on upgrades to the residences of public officials when the Zuma administration came into office.
- The most wasteful provincial government was, by quite a large margin, the ANC's KwaZulu-Natal Provincial Government, which spent **R 120.5 million** on a variety of items including unnecessary rental space, luxury cars and artwork.
- The biggest-spending single state-owned enterprise was the SABC which, despite being in dire financial straits, wasted **R 23 million** on unnecessary rented space and a propaganda video praising President Jacob Zuma.
- Minister of Defence Lindiwe Sisulu was responsible for the biggest expenditure on cars since the Wasteful Expenditure Monitor's last report in April, coming in at approximately **R 7 million** for a fleet of four Mercedes-Benz E-class cars.
- Entities reporting to Minister of Transport S'bu Ndebele recorded the largest amount spent on World Cup tickets - **R 20 million**
- Minister Ndebele was also responsible for the most expensive single item of self-congratulatory advertising at a total cost of **R 1.2 million**. Each insert include no less than 27 full-colour photographs of the Minister himself.
- Minister of Communications Siphwe Nyanda was responsible for the biggest spend on unnecessary luxury hotel accommodation, treating himself to prolonged stays at the five-star Mount Nelson Hotel and Twelve Apostles Hotel and Spa in Cape Town at a total cost of **R 515 000** to the South African taxpayer.
- Currently-suspended Director-General in the Department of Labour, Jimmy Manyi, was reportedly responsible for the most expensive single departmental party with a total cost of **R 350 000**

The rationale behind the Wasteful Expenditure Monitor

In delivering his 2009 budget to Parliament, Finance Minister Pravin Gordhan warned that the state had to be more disciplined in the way it managed its money.

He stated: *"After seven years of growing budgets and rising revenues there is a degree of fiscal looseness in*

the system and now is the time to tighten up on that looseness". He continued, "Money is not the problem ... it is how we spend the money. This has to improve".

The DA agreed wholeheartedly with Minister Gordhan's sentiments, and hoped to see them translate into action

in the Zuma administration. They failed to do so. Instead, what followed was a stream of fruitless and wasteful expenditure, more often than not to indulge the expensive personal tastes of members of the ANC executive. As part of its oversight role as the official opposition, in July last year the Democratic Alliance decided to create Wasteful Expenditure Monitor to track the ANC government's excessive expenditure.

We did this to show that, very often, the needs of the ANC elite are put before the needs of ordinary South Africans. We believe that by keeping a record of this expenditure, we can help to hold elected representatives to account, and assess the impact that wasteful expenditure has on the government's ability to deliver services as a whole.

How the Wasteful Expenditure Monitor works

Almost all items of wasteful expenditure tracked in our monitor have occurred during the Zuma administration's term in office, though, as a rule, we have included all items of ANC wasteful expenditure that have *emerged* for the first time since the monitor was launched on 26 July 2009. This means that, over the past twelve months, nearly **R1.5 billion** in wasteful expenditure has been brought to light, the bulk of which has been the result of rampant overspending by the Zuma administration on cars, hotels and other luxuries.

The expenditure we present in this document only represents funds that can without a doubt be considered wasteful squandering of public funds – be it on unnecessary glitz and partying, or on clear-cut and proven negligence or corruption. We have not, for example, included the millions involved in Julius Malema's contracts with the Limpopo provincial government, because no formal investigation has taken place into them, and thus there is no official verdict on the allegations that have been made.

The claims may appear weighty, and the fact that no proper action has been taken may be a consequence of the

ANC's disinterest in upholding the rule of law, but we have attempted to uphold a strict test: that if questions remain about the possible waste, we have generally not included it.

This also means that **R 1.5 billion** is, in all likelihood, a highly conservative estimate of the ANC's wasteful expenditure. In judging possible examples of wasteful expenditure we have also differentiated between mere difference of opinion in policy matters, and clear-cut instances of waste, based not on policy but on personal indulgence, corruption, cronyism or negligence.

We have not, for example, included the several hundred million rand of expenditure associated with the creation of several new departments by President Zuma, but we have included the array of luxury vehicles purchased by his administration. The former is a policy difference that has resulted in expenditure that we consider unnecessary; the latter, we believe, is clear-cut personal indulgence at public expense.

In sum, this means that what we present here is only a small fraction of what actually goes to waste, in a multitude of less obvious and provable ways, in government structures at all levels every single day. The tables that follow provide the details of examples of wasteful and fruitless spending uncovered since the last Wasteful Expenditure Monitor report in April this year. Of the 59 items of wasteful expenditure recorded since April 2010, approximately 66% were revealed as the result of replies to Parliamentary questions submitted by the DA, 29% came from information gathered by the news media and 5% from other research conducted by the DA Research Department. These examples have now been added to the previous total of R 1 billion, bringing the total for the past year to R 1.447 billion. Each table includes both the previous total, as released in April this year, and the new total.

Annexure 1: New Items of Wasteful Expenditure

1. Wasteful Marketing, e-Marketing and Self-Congratulatory Advertising

Previous total: R16.5-million
New total: R 19.4 million

Cost	Details	Minister/ Department/ Entity responsible
R 1.2 million	Self-congratulatory advertorial inserts in several national newspapers, each featuring 27 full-colour photographs of Transport Minister S'bu Ndebele.	Minister of Transport S'bu Ndebele
R 820 000	Printing and placing self-congratulatory advertorial inserts in several prominent newspapers.	Gauteng Provincial Government
R 725 000	Promotional documentary about President Jacob Zuma	SABC
R 31 000	Large, full-colour advertisement of herself in a major national newspaper	Gauteng Premier Nomvula Mokonyane

2. Hotelgate: Unnecessary Property Rentals, Hotel Stays and Property Renovations

Previous total: R 4.5 million
New total: R 241 million

Cost	Details	Minister/ Department/ Entity responsible
R 65 million	Upgrades to facilities servicing President Zuma's private home at Nkandla. These included a police station, helicopter pad, military clinic, visitors' centre, parking lot with parking for at least 40 vehicles and at least three smaller houses that will serve as staff quarters	Department of Public Works
R 34 million	Refurbishments to houses in Cape Town and Pretoria occupied by national Ministers and Deputy Ministers after the 2009 general elections	Department of Public Works
R 515 000	Prolonged stays at luxury five-star ideas, including the Mount Nelson Hotel and Twelve Apostles Hotel and Spa in Cape Town	Minister of Communications Siphwe Nyanda
R 319 265	Furniture for the Minister of Communication's official residence but	Department of Public Works/ Department of

	was kept in storage while the Minister lived in luxury hotels.	Communications
R3429	Cancelled accommodation reservations	Minister of Finance Pravin Gordhan
R 22.3 million	Rental space for FIFA World Cup 2010. This despite being offered a R 3.7 million space at Nasrec	SABC
R 2.5 million	Royal Households Department on travel and hotel accommodation for Zulu King Goodwill Zwelithini and his entourage.	KwaZulu-Natal Provincial Government
R 112.5 million	Unnecessarily rented office space in the Trizon Towers in Pietermaritzburg while vacant space in its own building was leased to other government departments. It is alleged that the contract was awarded irregularly.	KwaZulu-Natal provincial Health Department

3. Cargate: wasteful expenditure on luxury vehicles for politicians

Previous Total: 47.4 million

New total: R 65.8 million

Cost	Details	Minister/ Department/ Entity responsible
R 7 million	Fleet of Mercedes-Benz cars including four E-class sedans valued at approximately R1.17 million each	Minister of Defence Lindiwe Sisulu
R 6 million	Luxury Mercedes-Benz ML 4x4s for traditional kings.	Eastern Cape Provincial Government
R 2 million	Six Mercedes-Benz E-class cars for members of the Zulu Royal Family	KwaZulu-Natal Provincial Government
R 854 460	Two Mitsubishi Pajero 4x4s for members of Eastern Cape House of Traditional Affairs	Eastern Cape Provincial Government
R 1.1 million	Three Toyota Fortuner 4x4s for executive members of the Eastern Cape House of Traditional Leaders	Eastern Cape Provincial Government
R 1.4 million	Two luxury cars, a BMW X5 3.0d (at R 712 400) and a Mercedes-Benz E350 CDI (at R 666 850)	Minister of Public Service and Administration Richard Baloyi

4. Partygate: Wasteful expenditure on Parties, Conferences and Other Events

Previous total: R 203 million

New total: R 209 million

Cost	Details	Minister/ Department/ Entity responsible
R 350 000	End-of-year function for 150 department officials in December 2009.	Jimmy Manyi, DG of the Department of Labour.

R 5.7 million	'Golden handshake' to music producer Lebo Morake to 'walk away' from World Cup opening and closing ceremony project	City of Johannesburg
R 96 000	Dinner at the high-end Auberge Michel restaurant in Sandton in Johannesburg. When questioned about this, Mashatile replied by saying this kind of expenditure was 'nothing unusual'	Gauteng finance MEC Paul Mashatile
R 300 000	Party to celebrate executive mayor Gwen Ramokgopa's State of the City address and a gala dinner at the Pretoria City Hall	Tshwane Metro Council

5. Ticketgate: Wasteful expenditure on tickets to sports events and other entertainment for Ministers, Deputy Ministers, government officials and SOE employees

Current Total: R 135.9 million

Cost	Details	Minister/ Department/ Entity responsible
R 20 million	World Cup tickets	Department of Transport and associated entities
R 16.7 million	World Cup tickets	Department of Trade and Industry & IDC
R 12 million	World Cup tickets	Eskom
R 12.5 million	World Cup tickets	PetroSA
R 1.4 million	World Cup tickets	Central Energy Fund
R 5.2 million	World Cup tickets	Department of Communications
R 4.5 million	World Cup tickets, T-shirts and other paraphernalia	City of Johannesburg
R 4 million	World Cup tickets	Gauteng provincial government
R 6.8 million	World Cup tickets	Free State provincial government
R 15 million	World Cup tickets	Mangaung Municipality in the Free State
R 918 973	World Cup tickets	Department of Tourism
R 23 million	World Cup tickets	South African Airways (SAA)
R 800 000	World Cup tickets	South African Post Office
R 314 000	World Cup tickets	Council for Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR)
R1 million	World Cup tickets	Sentech

R3.3 million	World Cup tickets	SABC
R 730 520	World Cup tickets	Mbombela Municipality
R 1.2 million	World Cup tickets	Mpumulanga's Department of Sport
R 500 000	World Cup tickets	Tshwane municipality
R 278 160	World Cup tickets	Eastern Cape's Department of Sport
R 1.5 million	Tickets to the FIFA Confederations Cup	Airports Company of South Africa (ACSA)
R 300 000	Tickets to the Cape Town International Jazz festival	Airports Company of South Africa (ACSA)
R 54 000	'Hospitality tickets' to the Vodacom Super 14 Challenge	Airports Company of South Africa (ACSA)
R 170 000	Tickets to the FIFA Confederations Cup	Department of Mineral Resources
R 36 750	Tickets to the FIFA Confederations Cup	African Civil Aviation Authority (SACAA)
R 206 502	Tickets to the FIFA Confederations Cup	South African Maritime Safety Authority (SAMSA)
R 376 200	Tickets to the Cape Town International Jazz festival	Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa (PRASA)
R 1.8 million	Tickets to the FIFA Confederations Cup	Road Accident Fund (RAF)
R 1.4 million	Tickets to the FIFA Confederations Cup. These includes 'private suites' for senior RTMC officials.	Road Traffic Management Corporation (RTMC)

6. Other items of wasteful expenditure

Previous total: R 732.9 million

New total: R 776 million

Cost	Details	Minister/ Department/ Entity responsible
R16 million	18 learners irregularly sent on soccer training to Brazil.	Mayor of Ngaka Modiri Molema District Municipality
R 3 million	Sending a 200-strong delegation including councilors, a netball team, cultural ensemble, choir and soccer team to Lusaka to attend Zambia's Independence Day celebrations.	Mayor Zoleka Capa of OR Tambo Municipality
R 2 million	VIP protection officers for ANC Youth League President Julius Malema since November 2009	South African Police Service
R 9.5 million	Dedicated DoD VIP lounge at OR Tambo International Airport for use by Defence Minister Lindiwe Sisulu, department officials and official guests.	Department of Defence
R 3 million	Statue of Shaka Zulu for Durban's new	KZN Premier Zweli Mkhize

R 1.5 million	King Shaka International Airport Statue of an elephant that was removed because it resembled the emblem of the Inkatha Freedom Party (IFP)	eThekwini municipality
R 6.8 million	6333 traffic fines incurred by the SA diplomatic staff in London.	Department of International Relations and Cooperation
R 936 000	Paid to Queenstown education district chief education specialist Mzwandile Bula despite the latter failing to turn up to work for two years in a row.	Eastern Cape Education Department
R 533 000	Spent by members of the Zulu Royal Family on clothes between June and October 2007	KwaZulu-Natal Provincial Government

TOTAL WASTEFUL EXPENDITURE: R 1.447 BILLION

Annexure 2: {Archives} Wasteful Expenditure as of April 2010

1. {Archives – Prior to April 2010} Wasteful Marketing, e-Marketing and Self-Congratulatory Advertising

Total wasteful expenditure tracked: R16.5-million

COST	DETAILS	ANC OFFICIAL/S	DA RESPONSE
R700 000. [A full page advert in the Sunday Times costs R490 000 and in the City Press, R209 000.]	Two full colour advertisements taken out in the City Press and the Sunday Times newspapers.	Department of Correction Services; Minister Nosiviwe Mapisa-Nqakula.	The adverts promoted the Minister's budget vote speech.
R5.5 million	The Durban City Council is spending R5.5 million on a new tourism website.	Durban City Council, Municipal Manager, Mike Sutcliffe.	The DA has called for an investigation into the matter. We obtained an independent quote for the website which confirms that, given the specifications for the site (which the DA has in its possession), it should have cost no more than R250 000.
Approximately R10 million	The Durban Municipality spent R6m on their council website (as reported previously), an additional R6m for the 2010 website, and pay approximately R2.7 million a year for the website's maintenance.	Durban Municipality	The Democratic Alliance has indicated it will continue with its probe into the Web site. We are requesting details of what budget vote the funds came from, when and where the tender for the project was advertised, how many tender bids were received and the cost of each of these applications, and how the final decision was made.
R282 000	The Mpumalanga 2010 Integrated Office took out several full colour, half-page advertisements in The Sowetan newspaper,	Mpumalanga 2010 Integrated Office, and Mpumalanga provincial	The DA will be submitting a question to the Mpumalanga legislature

	promoting three events being hosted to celebrate 300 days until the 2010 Soccer World Cup Mpumalanga.	government	regarding this wasteful expenditure, and whether any future events of a similar nature have been planned.
--	---	------------	---

2. {Archives - Prior to April 2010} Hotelgate: Unnecessary Property Rentals, Hotel Stays and Property Renovations

Total wasteful expenditure tracked: R4.5-million

COST	DETAILS	ANC OFFICIAL/S	DA RESPONSE
Unknown. [In excess of R200 000.]	The National Commissioner of Correctional Services and the Gauteng Commissioner have been renting property at a cost of R30 000 per month and R35 000 per month respectively, despite both of them having an official residence available.	Department of Correction Services; Minister Nosiviwe Mapisa-Nqakula.	The DA has written to the Public Service Commission to investigate the matter, and to the Public Protector to investigate the Gauteng Commissioner.
Unknown. [In excess of R200 000.]	The Department of Public Works is revamping Kings House, the Presidential residence in Durban. In doing so it is importing lavish fittings at three times the cost of what the local industry can provide.	Department of Public Works, Minister Geoff Doidge.	The DA obtained a series of quotes from the local industry which put the import fittings into proper context.
Between R3000 and R5000 per person per night.	Two government ministers splash out on accommodation in an exclusive hotel, rejecting requests that officials tighten their belts during the economic crisis.	Minister of defence Lindiwe Sisulu and KwaZulu-Natal MEC for economic development and tourism Mike Mabuyakhulu stayed at the Beverly Hills Hotel in Umhlanga Rocks, north of Durban	Exact costs could not be established as Priya Naidoo from Southern Sun, which owns the Beverly Hills, refused to disclose the group's "specific" government rates.
R235 000	Through a parliamentary question, the DA uncovered the fact that the Department of Police had splurged out R235 000 on a luxury hotel.	Minister of Police - Nathi Mthethwa	Parliamentary questions submitted
R3.3 million	Police chief Bheki Cele's splurge on a R3.3 million-	Police chief Bheki Cele	Parliamentary questions

	rand house in an upmarket Pretoria suburb instead of opting for a less expensive official residence in Silverton demonstrated his lack of prudence and is a slap in the face for President Jacob Zuma's austerity measures.		submitted
R570 000	Further luxury hotel spending by Nathi Mthethwa	Police ministry / Nathi Mthethwa	Parliamentary questions submitted

3. {Archives - Prior to April 2010} **Cargate: wasteful expenditure on luxury vehicles for politicians** Total wasteful expenditure tracked: R47.4-million

COST	DETAILS	ANC OFFICIAL/S	DA RESPONSE
R2.4 million [R2.2 million plus R150 000]	The Department of Communications bought two new cars (BMW 750is) at a cost of R1.1 million each, for the minister; in addition it spent R150 000 on additional extras for the cars. The additional extras included items like 'rear seat entertainment' and a 'sports leather steering wheel'.	Department of Communications, Minister Sipiwe Nyanda.	The DA uncovered the expenditure through a parliamentary question.
R1.7 million	The Department of Education bought two new cars (a BMW 730D, and a Range Rover Sport TDV8) at a cost of R1.7 million, for the minister.	Department of Education, Minister Angie Motshekga.	The DA uncovered the expenditure through a parliamentary question.
R11 million	The Free State Provincial Cabinet purchased new Mercedes-Benzes for each member (11 in total). They comprised 10 Mercedes-Benz S500s and 1 Mercedes-Benz S600 for Premier Ace Magashule.	Free State Provincial Cabinet.	
R796 003	The Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries bought a new Mercedes Benz S350 for the Minister. It included R15 000 worth of extras.	Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, Minister Buyelwa Sonjica.	The DA obtained this information by submitting a parliamentary question.
R1 362 361	The Department of Police purchased two news cars (2008 BMW X5 3.0D and 2009 BMW X5 Si 3.0) at a cost of R1.3 million for the Minister.	Department of Police, Minister Nathi Mthethwa.	The cars include some R202 000 worth of extras, including reverse cameras; a navigation system; sport suspension; a

			sunroof; and electronic seat adjustment. The DA's statement on the issue can be found here.
R1 406 813	The Department of Science and Technology purchased two new cars (Mercedes Benz 2009 S250 and Mercedes Benz 2009 S250) at a cost of R1.4 million for the Minister. The cars included R150 000 worth of extras including Metallic paint; Command navigation; a media interface; DVD player; a technical off road package; Heated front seats; Xenon active lights; a Sunroof; run flat and private glass. The DA's statement on the issue can be found here.	Department of Science and Technology, Minister Naledi Pandor.	
R1, 263, 113	Minister of Women, Children and People with Disabilities, has purchased a Range Rover for the Pretoria office and an Audi A6 for the Cape Town office.	Ms Noluthando Mayende-Sibiya, Minister of Women, Children and People with Disabilities	The minister responded to a parliamentary question asked by Mrs D Robinson (DA), regarding the purchase of the new vehicles, the cost involved and whether the purchase was necessary.
R1 million	The City Press reported on North West province's Moretele Mayor, Asnath Molekwa, who bought a Toyota Prada valued at more than R480 000 and a BMW X5 at more than R550 000.	North West province's Moretele Mayor, Asnath Molekwa	The DA will be submitting a question to the North West province legislature regarding this wasteful expenditure, and why due procedure was not followed when Molekwa acquired the BMW X5. The DA will also be asking what is being done to address the dire state of the public service in this district
R1.1 million	The Department of Higher Education has purchased a new R1.1 million BMW	Blade Nzimande	

	7501 for Minister Blade Nzimande, according to a reply to a DA parliamentary question.		
R740 000	Bitou Mayor Lulama Mvimbi's new BMW X5 at a cost of R740 000, is the most expensive vehicle used by any official in the entire Western and Eastern Cape provinces	Bitou Mayor Lulama Mvimbi	
R796 003	Mercedes Benz 2009 S350	Tina Joemat-Petterson, Minister of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries	
R757 545	Mercedes Benz E500	Aaron Motsoaledi, Minister of Health	
R820 204	Range Rover HSE	Phumulo Masualle, MEC for health	
R616 000	Audi Q7 3.0 litre TDI	Pemmy Majodina, MEC for public works	
R772 266	Mercedes- Benz ML500	Mcebisi Jonas, MEC for finance	
R620 000	Mercedes-Benz ML 320 CDI	Sibongile Manana, MEC for community safety	
R583 000	Mercedes-Benz ML 500	Dikeledi Mahlangu, MEC for health	
R699 000	Mercedes-Benz ML 350	Mohlalefi Mokoena, MEC for traditional affairs	
R845 200	BMW X5	Madala Masuku, MEC for human settlement	
R727 571	BMW X5	Pinky Kekana, MEC for transport	
R878700	BMW 740i	Boitumelo Tshwene, MEC for Agriculture	
R900000	BMW 735	Mahlakeng Mahlakeng, MEC for public works	
R900000	Mercedes GL500	Desbo Sefanyetso, MEC for housing	
R874 200	Merc GL500	Johannes "OJ" Tselapedi, MEC for education	

R795064	Audi Q7 4.2	Grace Pampiri, MEC for sports and culture	
R890 500	BMW X6	Gordon Kegakilwe, MEC for local government	
R1.5-million	BMW 550is x2	Thokozile Xasa, Deputy minister of tourism	
R1 625 366	Deputy Minister of Communications, Dina Pule purchased a Mercedes Benz GL320 CDI at a cost of R868 000 for the Pretoria office, and an Audi Q7 4.2 TDI at a cost of R757 366 for the Cape Town office.	Deputy Minister of Communications, Dina Pule	This information was revealed in response to a DA parliamentary question.
R672 938	Deputy Minister of Public Enterprises purchased an Iridium Silver Mercedes-Benz E350	Department of Public Enterprises	
R900,000	A reply to a Democratic Alliance parliamentary question has revealed that the department of water and environment affairs has purchased a R900,000 BMW for deputy minister Rejoice Mabudafhasi.	Department of Water and Environment Affairs Deputy Minister Rejoice Mabudafhasi	
R1.2 million	A BMW 7 Series was bought for former Finance Minister, Trevor Manuel, at a cost of R1.2-million and included R100,000 in unnecessary accessories.	Minister in the Presidency, Trevor Manuel	
R1.6-million	A reply to a Democratic Alliance parliamentary question reveals that Deputy Police Minister Fikile Mbalula has spent R1.6-million on two new ministerial vehicles, including R83 879 on extras like ceramic surround controls, an off road package, media interface and a multi-contour seat package.	Deputy Police Minister Fikile Mbalula	
R 576 444	A BMW 530d, 2009 model, was purchased for the Deputy Minister of Human Settlements at a cost of R 576 444.14 VAT. Inclusive	Deputy Minister of Human Settlements	
R662 499	The Minister in the presidency purchased a	Minister in the presidency	

	Volkswagen Touareg V8, 4.2, at a total cost of R662 499, including Extras to the value of R43 440		
R748 255	A Mercedes Benz ML500 at a cost of R748 255 was purchased for the Deputy Minister Minister of Trade and Industry Ntuli	Department of Trade and Industry	
R 2,371,305.44	Audi Q7 2009 <i>R591422.86</i> Audi Q7 2009 <i>R592177.86</i> Audi Q7 2009 <i>R593474.86</i> Audi Q7 2009 <i>R594229.86</i>	Minister of Rural Development and Land Reform	The DA uncovered the expenditure through a parliamentary question
R383 618	In the response by Economic Development MEC Mike Mabuyakhulu to a parliamentary question, he states that between May 11 and the end of August, he was paid a total of R383 618.07 for using his car on official business (travel claims). In May he was paid R93 778.18, in June R110 165.82, in July R95 771.93 while in August, he was paid R83 902.14.	Economic Development MEC Mike Mabuyakhulu	

4. {Archives - Prior to April 2010} Partygate: Wasteful expenditure on Parties, Banquets and Other Events

Total wasteful expenditure tracked: R203-million

COST	DETAILS	ANC OFFICIAL/S	DA RESPONSE
R43 100	The Department of Trade and Industry and the Department of Economic Development held a party to celebrate their budget vote speeches.	Department of Trade and Industry, Minister Rob Davies. Department of Economic Development, Minister Ebrahim Patel.	The DA obtained this information by submitting a parliamentary question.
R33 300	The Department of Science and Technology held a party to celebrate its budget vote.	Department of Science and Technology, Minister Naledi Pandor.	The DA obtained this information by submitting a parliamentary question.
R10.6 million	The Premier of KwaZulu-Natal held an inauguration party at a cost of R10.6 million to the taxpayer.	Premier of KwaZulu-Natal, Zweli Mkhize.	See the DA's statement on the issue. The DA has also submitted questions to every province,

			to inquire if they held an inauguration party and, if so, at what cost.
R7 million	The Free State Government spent R7 million on the opening of the Free State legislature in June 2009.	Department of the Premier, the Free State Provincial Government.	
R104 407	The Department of Public Service and Administration held a party to celebrate its budget vote.	Department of Public Service and Administration, Minister Richard Baloyi.	The DA obtained this information by submitting a parliamentary question.
R41 558	The Department of State Security held a party to celebrate its budget vote.	Department of State Security, Minister Siyabonga Cwele.	The DA obtained this information by submitting a parliamentary question.
R65 639	The Department of Health held two parties to celebrate its budget vote speech in the National Assembly (R34 000) and the National Council of Provinces (R31 000) respectively.	Department of Health, Minister Pakishe Aaron Motsoaledi.	The DA obtained this information by submitting a parliamentary question.
R52 365	The Department of Home Affairs held a party to celebrate its budget vote speech.	Department of Home Affairs, Minister Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma.	The DA obtained this information by submitting a parliamentary question.
Approx R242 000	Parliament spent at least R120 000 hiring hotels for committee meetings, despite parliamentary committee rooms being available. This figure is no doubt far below the actual cost, as it is based only on one particular round of committee meetings and there are a far number in reality. It spent approximately the same amount on accommodation.	Parliament, Speaker of Parliament, Hon. Max Sisulu.	The DA broke this story by undertaking snap survey. All the relevant hotels were phoned and costs obtained. The DA also took pictures of empty parliamentary committee rooms which were overlooked in favour of hotels and hired venues.
R300 000	In response to a DA parliamentary question, the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform (DRDLF) has admitted to spending R300k from the pockets of taxpayers and at the cost of service delivery - on a 'project launch'	Department of Rural Development and Land Reform	The DA will be asking the Department how it plans to achieve its objectives when it has already started out on the wrong foot and whether it thinks the R300 000 was well

	celebration party.		spent when it has such a mammoth task of creating sustainable rural communities.
R84 240	Department of Public Works 2009 budget vote celebration party.	Department of Public Works	
R40m	National Police Day, involving the summoning of one out of every three police officers in the country to Bloemfontein. Minister has refused in parliamentary questions to confirm exact amount spent. R40m is a conservative estimate based both on figures made available to us by senior police officials and reasonable expected costs for the array of functions known to have been held.	Minister of Police	Questions to the Minister
R42m	A series of gala dinners and music concerts, and the handing out of complementary gifts by the Arts and Culture department.	Department of Arts and Culture	Continuing to monitor
R104 838	A parliamentary reply received indicated that Minister of Sports and Recreation, Mr Makhenkesi Stofile, decided to celebrate the delivery of his budget speech with a cocktail dinner party costing R104 838. With only 100 attendees, this results in a cost of R1000 a head per guest. The decision to host a party to celebrate no achievements and nothing more than an announcement is absurd.	Department of Sports and Recreation	
R33 330	Department of science and technology - Budget vote party	Department of Science and Technology	
R267 000	The Minister of Basic Education responded to a DA parliamentary question and admitted to spending R267 000 on a budget vote party	Department of Education	
R447 252	The funded Industrial Development Corporation (IDC) rehired Wendy Luhabe 2 weeks after a R500,000 farewell party was held for her.	State funded Industrial Development Corporation (IDC)	

	<p>Rob Davies, the minister of trade and industry, confirmed in a written response to a parliamentary question that the funded Industrial Development Corporation (IDC) was unaware of the plan to rehire Wendy Luhabe, wife of former Gauteng premier Sam Shilowa, when it threw the R447 252.03 farewell bash for her. The party for 120 guests was held on September 11 last year and the corporation was told two weeks later that Luhabe was back on board.</p>		
R461 227	<p>A party was organized to mark the occasion of the delivery of the Minister of Transport's Budget Vote in an Extended Public Committee in the National Assembly on Friday, 03 July 2009, to the amount of R461 227.81.</p> <p>The function was paid for entirely by the Department of Transport. It included R248613.95 spent on décor and sound equipment, while catering costs amounted to R61919.15. A further R138486.71 was spent on an exhibition.</p>	Department of transport	
R 1 340 388	<p>The amount spent by several National Departments on budget vote parties:</p> <p>Energy: R412 077 Social Development - R180 026 Arts and Culture - R223 281 International Relations - R160 440 Human Settlements - R114 184 Correctional Services - R101 594 Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs - R67 768 Police - R56 695 Justice and Constitutional Development - R24 323</p>	Various	
R23.9 million	<p>A response to a Democratic Alliance (DA) parliamentary question revealed that the DPSSA spent R54 million on 22</p>	Department of Public Service and Administration	

	conferences during the period 1 January 2006 to 30 September 2009. The most expensive event (Global Forum V Fighting Corruption and Safeguarding Integrity) cost R23, 9 million, for just 850 guests. The average cost per head in the case ballooned to a staggering R28 118.		
R584 000	The Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa spent R584,810.92 during the Soweto function which did not benefit commuters	Department of Transport	
R75.7m	The Department of Transport spent R75.7m on hosting four conferences between 2007 and 2009, which included nearly R12-million spent on VIP shuttle services, and millions more spent on various forms of entertainment, advertising, cocktail functions and promotional gifts. The Department is yet to explain how these conferences added a single cent of value to any of the Department's infrastructure delivery projects.	Department of Transport	

5. {Archives – Prior to April 2010} Other items of wasteful expenditure

Total wasteful expenditure tracked: R732.9-million

COST	DETAILS	ANC OFFICIAL/S	DA RESPONSE
R150 million	A reply to a Democratic Alliance (DA) parliamentary question has revealed that the South African Police Service (SAPS) purchased a Cessna Citation Sovereign private business jet, at a cost of R150 million, to usher cabinet ministers and senior officials around South Africa and Africa.	South African Police Service	
Unknown. [In excess of R20 million.]	The South African government is hosting ousted Haitian leader Jean-Bertrand Aristide, at a cost of R5 million a year. He enjoys the same privileges as a Cabinet Minister,	Department of International Relations and Cooperation, Minister Maite Nkoana-	The DA uncovered the costs through a parliamentary question.

	including a car allowance, security and accommodation. He has been in the country since mid-2004.	Mashabane.	
Unknown.	A KPMG report last year implicated Advocate Matyolo-Dube, Secretary to the NCOP and acting chief of legal services, in a network of nepotism which involved the employment of various members of her family and church circle in plum government positions.	Speaker of Parliament, Hon. Max Sisulu.	The DA obtained a copy of the KPMG report into the financial mismanagement of parliament and made its findings known to the public. The party has also written to the Speaker, asking for a full investigation.
R15.5 million	The National Lottery, in probable contravention of the law, has paid out a total of R15.5m to the Jazz Foundation of South Africa, even though the CEO of the Foundation - Mr Leabua (Oupa) Salemane - is also a member of the Lotto's Arts and Culture Distributing Agency.	Department of Trade and Industry, Minister Rob Davies.	The DA is considering laying criminal charges on the matter.
R6 million (approximately)	Hundreds of thousands of specially watermarked papers for matric certificates were scrapped, so that new ones with a larger South African coat of arms could be printed instead.	Minister of Basic Education Angie Motshekga	The DA will be asking parliamentary questions about the exact cost.
R1.17 million	<i>According to the Auditor General, "Fruitless and wasteful expenditure to the amount of R1,166 million incurred in 2008 has not been condoned" for the Construction Education Training Authority(CETA)</i>	Construction Education Training Authority	The DA believes government should rather offer subsidies to private companies to allow them in turn to offer internships and apprenticeships to young students.
R16.5-million	The Land Bank's 2008/09 Annual Report has revealed that it lost R16.5-million in fruitless and wasteful expenditure in the last financial year	Land Bank	While the DA applauds the financial recovery that the Land Bank has been able to achieve so far, it is overshadowed by this waste of public money.
R1 , 45 million	As noted in the Auditor General's report of the Tourism, Hospitality and Sport Education and	Tourism, Hospitality and Sport Education and Training	The DA believes government should rather offer subsidies to

	Training Authority, " <i>Theta incurred fruitless and wasteful expenditure amounting to R1 456 000 for the settlements of the legal case with a service provider.</i> "	Authority (THETA)	private companies to allow them in turn to offer internships and apprenticeships to young students.
Approximately R1 million	From The Sowetan: ' <i>A latest report by the integrity management unit investigation shows that Mpumalanga's embattled public works head has wasted nearly R1 million... by irregularly awarding multimillion-rand contracts to undeserving companies.</i> '	Mpumalanga's public works head, Priscilla Nkwiniika,	The DA will be submitting a question to the Mpumalanga legislature regarding this wasteful expenditure and what is being done to hold Nkwiniika to account.
R4million	According to the AG report, assets, including vehicles, to the value of over R4m could not be found.	Department of social services	
R22 million	SABC commissioned local programming that it does not intend on using	SABC	
R15, 876 million	147 would-be artisans were employed by the Department of Public Works. However, instead of promised apprenticeships, some have played cards in the sun, braided each other's hair, slept — and gone drinking. All the while taking home a monthly salary of close to R6000 each (over 18 months). The Sunday Times has established that owing to cost-cutting in the department, none of the trainees, recruited through national newspaper adverts in 2007, ever received their promised training.	Department of Public Works	
R101 408	Wasteful expenditure recorded in the 2008/09 National Treasury Annual Report	National Treasury	
R4 979 000	Wasteful expenditure recorded in the 2008/09 Sport and Recreation Annual Report	Department of Sport and Recreation	
R661 646	The department suffered a total loss of R661 646 as a result of the changing of banking details (due to possible fraudulent activity).	Department of Public Works	

R15m	Spousal support under President Zuma.	President Zuma	Statement
Approx.R645 000	A range of financial irregularities at Lejwelepustwa district municipality in the Free State, including two Bomag construction vehicles bought for R440 000, but never received, groceries of more than R15,000, R4000 spent on eight soccer balls, R7200 on 12 volleyballs and R4200 on six rugby balls. An employee, who exceeded her sick leave by 192 working days, was paid, resulting in an expense of R174,129.	Lejwelepustwa District Municipality	Supporting a call for a forensic audit into its affairs
R3m	Covering the costs of a 40-strong Nigerian delegation overseeing the April election in KwaZulu-Natal, including a food bill of R267,000.	KwaZulu-Natal legislature	Requested the Auditor-General to investigate
R2.9 million	It emerged that the KwaZulu-Natal government's department of economic development and tourism has wasted an additional R2.9-million on a theatre production, in much the same way as the Department of Housing did towards the end of last year.	KwaZulu-Natal government's department of economic development and tourism	
R9 800 000	The KwaZulu-Natal government, the MEC for community safety and head of the department can't explain the waste of R10-million on "a commission of inquiry into ineffective policing", from 2005, that produced no results - not even a final report.	Commission of Inquiry chairperson, Advocate Stix Mdladla	
R4.8 million	Wasteful expenditure recorded in the 2008/09 Land Affairs annual report	Department of Land Affairs	
R4 587 000	Wasteful expenditure recorded in the 2008/09 Department of Defence Annual Report	Department of Defence	
R2.2 million	As reported in the Annual Report - wasteful expenditure of R2.2 million for defective work on the construction of the Eesterus Clinic and the Sebokeng Folateng.	Gauteng Department of Health	
R496 371	Wasteful expenditure recorded in the 2008/09 Department of Arts and	Department of Arts and Culture	

	Culture Annual Report		
R111.46-million	A report by the Auditor General has revealed fruitless, wasteful and irregular expenditure of R111.46 million – which was paid for the acquisition of international programme content – "...double payments, overpayments, material paid for but not received, programme titles acquired more than once from the same supplier during the same license period." No corrective action taken by the former GCEO, despite his knowledge thereof.	SABC	
R 893 641	Private Security Industry Regulatory Authority (PSIRA), the public body that regulates the private security industry and controls the practices of private security service providers has purchased R615 043 worth of printer cartridges that were not compatible with their printers; And also signed a lease to the amount of R278 598 for premises that are not utilised by them;	Private Security Industry Regulatory Authority (PSIRA)	
R22,5 million	Sarafina-style theatre production, paid for by the Department of Human Settlements in the 2008/09 financial year (under former minister Lindiwe Sisulu)	Department of Human Settlements	
R40 million	The Department of Human Settlements' reply to a Democratic Alliance (DA) parliamentary question has revealed that it spent R60 million on advertising during the 2008/09 financial year after an initial budget of R20 million.	Department of Human Settlements	
R157 000	<i>From the Sowetan:</i> In the Gauteng Health Department, R107 000 of taxpayer's money was spent on calendars that came too late to be useful, and another R50 000 on a workshop that most delegates didn't pitch for (62/150 attended).	Gauteng Health Department	
R1,6 million	<i>From Pretoria News:</i> The head of human resources at the Department of Communications faces 26 internal disciplinary charges	Department of Communications	

	<p>related to her alleged misconduct, including gross negligence, breach of duties and wasteful expenditure.</p> <p>She allegedly insisted that three companies provide recruitment services to the department for 2 years at a cost of R3-million, against department policy.</p> <p>The department believes that this amounted to "fruitless and wasteful" expenditure of about R1,6m as there were employees in the department who could have done the same job.</p>		
R4-million	<p><i>From the Sowetan:</i> An Mpumalanga government department that must recover R61-million lost to corrupt officials has misspent a further R4-million. The Department of Public Works, Roads and Transport claims it spent the money "wrongly" while preparing for the construction of the provincial archive in Mbombela. "The report of the auditor-general indicated that the department could not provide detailed information on the amount of R4 116 721 that was spent on the planning of the archive building," said provincial chairperson of the Select Committee on Public Accounts (Scopa), Fish Mahlalela.</p>	Department of Public Works, Roads and Transport	
R32 million	<p>The Department of Public Works has forked out R32 million (or 10% of the value of the contract) to a contractor for a housing project, which was cancelled due to inadequate research prior to awarding the tender.</p>	Department of Public Works	
R117,5 million	<p>It is costing the Gauteng provincial government R117.5m to cancel its motorsport contracts. This is another enormous waste of money, which could have been avoided had the right decisions been made years ago. Economic Development MEC Firoz Cachalia tried to claim that his department had saved R796 m by cancelling the A1Gp, SBK and Superstars</p>	Gauteng Provincial Government	

	contracts. In Reality, his department did not save R700m, it lost R117m.		
R100m	About R100 million of taxpayers' money had been lost due to financial mismanagement in 18 KwaZulu-Natal municipalities, the province's co-operative governance MEC confirmed in February.	KwaZulu-Natal Municipalities	
Unknown. [In excess of R35 000.]	The Gauteng Commissioner of Correctional Services undertook a series of trips of little or no relevance to her mandate as Commissioner. The trips included hiring a Mercedes Benz at a cost of R2 000 per day and attending the Grahamstown Festival.	Department of Correction Services; Minister Nosiviwe Mapisa-Nqakula.	The DA has taken the Commissioner to the Public Protector.
R90 000	The North West Education Department spent about R90 000 to pamper their officials at a day spa. According to Beeld newspaper: "the officialdom chose the exotic Mangwanani Moroccan full day package which cost R2 099 per person. They began with a light breakfast yesterday morning, after which followed face treatments, pressure point massages, body exfoliation, Izimanga (full body massage) and Molala (antique Indian / North African head massage). They were spoilt further with a decadent luncheon, refreshments from the bar and a variety of desserts. A gift package to spoil them further, included pampering products and long orange dressing gowns with matching hoods and slippers."	Department of Education, North West, MEC Johannes Tselapedi.	